

REPUBLIC OF THE MARSHALL ISLANDS

# IN THE HIGH COURT OF THE REPUBLIC OF THE MARSHALL ISLANDS

EIGIGU HOLDINGS CORPORATION,

Plaintiff,

v.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Defendants.

Divine Waiti, counsel for plaintiff James McCaffrey, counsel for defendants

The following findings of fact are established and cannot be changed. The following conclusions of law constitute the law of the case and cannot be changed.

### FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. From approximately June 1993 through June 1996, Rubin Tsitsi ("Tsitsi") was the authorized agent of Nauru Local Government Council ("NLGC").<sup>1</sup>
- 2. From June 1996 through April 23, 2012, Tsitsi was the authorized agent of plaintiff Eigigu Holdings Corporation ("EHC").

In some documents, NLGC is referred to by the shortened name "Nauru Council." NLGC and Nauru Council are one and the same. For consistency, I use NLGC, and not Nauru Council, in this document.

- 3. In 1990, several RMI land title holders ("landowners") and NLGC entered into a 50-year lease ("the master lease") for 3.3763 acres in Remejon and Wotje wetos in Delap. The primary purpose of the master lease was for NLGC to complete the construction of, and to operate, the Eastern Gateway Hotel. NLGC was allowed to enter into subleases without landowners' consent.
  - 4. In June 1996, NLGC transferred its real property holdings and interests to EHC.
- 5. In April 2001, NLGC entered into a 10-year sublease ("the first sublease") with defendants Leander Leander and Lijun Leander ("Leanders") for a portion of the Eastern Gateway Hotel building ("the premises"). Tsitsi signed the sublease as agent for NLGC.
- 6. In September 2002, NLGC and Leanders entered into a second sublease. The second sublease replaced the first sublease and extended the lease period through September 2035. Tsitsi signed the second sublease as agent for NLGC. Leanders paid \$200,000 in advance as full rent through September 2035.
- 7. In July 2010, NLGC and Leanders entered into a third sublease. The third sublease replaced the second sublease and extended the lease period through February 2040. Tsitsi signed the third sublease as agent for NLGC. Leanders paid \$271,000 (including the \$200,000 paid previously) in advance as full rent through February 2040. This third sublease is still in effect.
  - 8. Leanders entered into sub-subleases with other entities or individuals.
- 9. In February 2012, landowners demanded that NLGC and EHC cure several alleged breaches of the master lease. When the breaches were not timely cured, landowners terminated the master lease effective April 6, 2012.

- 10. On April 23, 2012, the Nauru Cabinet revoked Tsitsi's authority.
- 11. In May 2013, EHC and landowners entered into two written agreements. The first agreement: required EHC to pay approximately \$182,000 in damages to landowners over a 12-month period; required landowners, upon full payment of the \$182,000, to file a revocation of the termination of the master lease; and required EHC and landowners to sign the second agreement. The second agreement was entitled "2013 Amendment to the 1990 Lease Agreement for the Eastern Gateway Hotel." It states that it is an amendment to the master lease, and that EHC "desires to restore its relations with the Landowners and continue the original lease."
- 12. In November 2013, EHC and landowners entered into a written Ground Lease Agreement ("the November 2013 agreement"). The November 2013 agreement includes several amendments to the master lease. Although it states that the termination of the master lease "terminated any existing subleases or subtenancies ... as a matter of law," it also recognizes that there may be "current and legally enforceable subleases on the premises."

# **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- 1. From approximately June 1993 through April 23, 2012, Tsitsi was the authorized agent of first NLGC and then EHC.
- 2. The parties' third sublease is the sublease by which the resolution of this matter must be determined.
- 3. Landowners' April 2012 termination of the master lease did not result in the termination of any subleases because the November 2013 agreement between EHC and landowners restored or revived the 1990 master lease and any and all subleases.

4. 24 MIRC §438 does not make any of the three subleases void. The purpose of Section 438 is to protect customary land title holders who ascend during the term of a lease, and not to protect corporate lessors who remain throughout the term of a lease. When a contract involves private parties and not a public interest, the parties may, as between themselves, waive statutory requirements or statutory prohibitions. In addition, Section 438(2) does not state that the *lease* is void if offending advance payments are made. It states only that offending *payments* are void as against specified individuals.

DATED this 12th day of October, 2018.

BY THE COURT:

COLIN R. WINCHESTER

Chullmelietar

Associate Justice



Colin Winchester < colinwinchester 5862@gmail.com>

# **Eigigu v Leander - Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions** 6 messages

Colin Winchester < colinwinchester 5862@gmail.com >

Thu, Oct 11, 2018 at 11:52 AM

To: Divine Waiti <djwaiti@gmail.com>, James McCaffrey <james@mccaffreyfirm.com> Bcc: Colin Winchester <colinwinchester5862@gmail.com>

#### Counsel:

Please review the following proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law. If you find any errors, or if you wish to suggest modifications or additions, please respond to THIS email address as soon as possible. Do not use the judiciary's email account because I will not be looking there for your suggestions.

I intend to finalize this project on Friday, October 12, so your ASAP response is appreciated. Thank you. Judge Winchester

The following findings of fact are established and cannot be changed. The following conclusions of law constitute the law of the case and cannot be changed.

#### **FINDINGS OF FACT**

- 1. From approximately June 1993 through June 1996, Rubin Tsitsi ("Tsitsi") was the authorized agent of Nauru Local Government Council ("NLGC").<sup>1</sup>
- 2. From June 1996 through April 23, 2012, Tsitsi was the authorized agent of plaintiff Eigigu Holdings Corporation ("EHC").
- 3. In 1990, several RMI land title holders ("landowners") and NLGC entered into a 50-year lease ("the master lease") for 3.3763 acres in Remejon and Wotje wetos in Delap. The primary purpose of the master lease was for NLGC to complete the construction of, and to operate, the Eastern Gateway Hotel. NLGC was allowed to enter into subleases without landowners' consent.
- 4. In June 1996, NLGC transferred its real property holdings and interests to EHC.
- 5. In April 2001, NLGC entered into a 10-year sublease ("the first sublease") with defendants Leander Leander and Lijun Leander ("Leanders") for a portion of the Eastern Gateway Hotel building ("the premises"). Tsitsi signed the sublease as agent for NLGC.
- 6. In September 2002, NLGC and Leanders entered into a second sublease. The second sublease replaced the first sublease and extended the lease period through September 2035. Tsitsi signed the second sublease as agent for NLGC. Leanders paid \$200,000 in advance as full rent through September 2035.
- 7. In July 2010, NLGC and Leanders entered into a third sublease. The third sublease replaced the second sublease and extended the lease period through February 2040. Tsitsi signed the third sublease as agent for NLGC. Leanders paid \$271,000 (including the \$200,000 paid previously) in advance as full rent through February 2040. This third sublease is still in effect.
- 8. Leanders entered into sub-subleases with other entities or individuals.
- 9. In February 2012, landowners demanded that NLGC and EHC cure several alleged breaches of the master lease. When the breaches were not timely cured, landowners terminated the master lease effective April 6, 2012.

- 10. On April 23, 2012, the Nauru Cabinet revoked Tsitsi's authority.
- 11. In May 2013, EHC and landowners entered into two written agreements. The first agreement: required EHC to pay approximately \$182,000 in damages to landowners over a 12-month period; required landowners, upon full payment of the \$182,000, to file a revocation of the termination of the master lease; and required EHC and landowners to sign the second agreement. The second agreement was entitled "2013 Amendment to the 1990 Lease Agreement for the Eastern Gateway Hotel." It states that it is an amendment to the master lease, and that EHC "desires to restore its relations with the Landowners and continue the original lease."
- 12. In November 2013, EHC and landowners entered into a written Ground Lease Agreement ("the November 2013 agreement"). The November 2013 agreement includes several amendments to the master lease. Although it states that the termination of the master lease "terminated any existing subleases or subtenancies ... as a matter of law," it also recognizes that there may be "current and legally enforceable subleases on the premises."

#### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- 1. From approximately June 1993 through April 23, 2012, Tsitsi was the authorized agent of first NLGC and then EHC.
- 2. The parties' third sublease is the sublease by which the resolution of this matter must be determined.
- 3. Landowners' April 2012 termination of the master lease did not result in the termination of any subleases because the November 2013 agreement between EHC and landowners restored or revived the 1990 master lease and any and all subleases.

**END** 

Colin R. Winchester
Associate Justice
High Court
Republic of the Marshall Islands

Colin Winchester < colinwinchester 5862@gmail.com>

Thu, Oct 11, 2018 at 11:55 AM

To: marsollawyers@gmail.com, James McCaffrey <james@mccaffreyfirm.com>

[Quoted text hidden]

## James McCaffrey <James@mccaffreyfirm.com>

Thu, Oct 11, 2018 at 4:02 PM

To: Colin Winchester <colinwinchester5862@gmail.com>, marsollawyers@gmail.com

Cc: Divine waiti <djwaiti@gmail.com>

Dear Judge Winchester:

I concur with the proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law and have no modifications or additions.

Please excuse my delay in replying. I have twice lost Internet today and I only saw this email a few moments ago.

Regards,

James McCaffrey

From: Colin Winchester [mailto:colinwinchester5862@gmail.com]

**Sent:** Thursday, October 11, 2018 11:56 AM **To:** marsollawyers@gmail.com; James McCaffrey

Subject: Fwd: Eigigu v Leander - Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions

[Quoted text hidden]



Virus-free. www.avg.com

Divine Waiti <marsollawyers@gmail.com>

Fri, Oct 12, 2018 at 5:43 AM

To: colinwinchester5862@gmail.com Cc: james@mccaffreyfirm.com

Judge Winchester,

It seems that what had been discussed on Wednesday is covered. I would just like if you could mention that the Plaintiff has amended the complaint and that the issue of nuisance and waste is to be determined in the later course.

#### Regards,

[Quoted text hidden]

Divine F. Waiti
Attorney At Law
Marsol Lawyers & Consultants
P O Box 3897 MH 96960
Ace One Stop - 2nd Floor
Ph: +692 455 3575
www.marsollawyers.com

# James McCaffrey < James@mccaffreyfirm.com>

Fri, Oct 12, 2018 at 8:47 AM

To: Divine Waiti <marsollawyers@gmail.com>, colinwinchester5862@gmail.com

I would note that these are the only claims remaining to be tried.

Jim

From: Divine Waiti [mailto:marsollawyers@gmail.com]

**Sent:** Friday, October 12, 2018 5:44 AM **To:** colinwinchester5862@gmail.com **Cc:** james@mccaffreyfirm.com

Subject: Re: Eigigu v Leander - Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions

[Quoted text hidden]



Virus-free. www.avg.com

Colin Winchester <colinwinchester5862@gmail.com>

To: James McCaffrey <James@mccaffreyfirm.com>

Cc: marsollawyers@gmail.com

Fri, Oct 12, 2018 at 10:05 AM

#### Counsel:

My purpose in preparing the findings of fact and conclusions of law was to identify the facts and legal issues that have already been decided. It was not, and is not, to identify the facts and legal issues still remaining. I have no way of knowing if one or both of you will yet come up with a previously undiscovered issue or locate some critical fact that we have not yet discussed and resolved. I will therefore sign and distribute the document as written. Watch or it to come to you from the clerk later today. Thank you. [Quoted text hidden]

IN THE _	HIGH	COURT
	O	FTHE.
REPU	BLIC OF THE	MARSHALL ISLANDS

Eigigu Holdings Corporation	)	Civil	Case No. 2014-067	
Plaintiff  V  Leander Leander and Lijun Leander  Defendant		CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE		
Tanya Lomae , Asst. Clerk of served the Findings Of Fact And Conclusions		ereby certify	that on 10/12/18	
1. Divine Waiti by 2. James McCaffrey by 3	y 🖌 Email	on:  Fax  Fax  Fax	Personal Hand Delivery Personal Hand Delivery Personal Hand Delivery	
4 by	y Email	Fax [	Personal Hand Delivery	
Tanya Lomae  Asst. Clerk of the Courts  Marshall Islands Judiciary	FILED:		OCT 12 2018  CMCL T. CLERK OF COURTS	